Health and sustainable development: the future

Patrick Bond, Director, University of KwaZulu-Natal Centre for Civil Society and Professor of Political Economy, University of the Witwatersrand School of Governance

Sustainable Development Goals, South Africa's “War on Poverty”, improvements in Gini Coefficient inequality measurement, and other unhealthy fictions

presented to the Public Health Association of South Africa Conference, Durban, 8 October 2015
A GIFT FROM THE CORPORATE WORLD!

SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT

Rio+10

Johannesburg World Summit 2002
Sustainable development is development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs.

contains within it two key concepts:

1) the concept of ‘needs’, in particular the essential needs of the world’s poor, to which overriding priority should be given; and

2) the idea of limitations imposed by the state of technology and social organization on the environment’s ability to meet present and future needs.
John Drexhage and Deborah Murphy, International Institute for Sustainable Development

“over the past 20 years, sustainable development has often been compartmentalized as an environmental issue. Added to this, and potentially more limiting for the sustainable development agenda, is the reigning orientation of development as purely economic growth.”
World Bank’s ‘impeccable’ logic of green capitalist pollution trade

DATE: December 12, 1991
TO: Distribution
FR: Lawrence H. Summers

“I think the economic logic behind dumping a load of toxic waste in the lowest wage country is impeccable and we should face up to that... Africa is vastly underpolluted”

(preparing for original Rio Earth Summit, secret memo of Bank chief economist Larry Summers – full memo: www.whirledbank.org)
The measurements of the costs of health impairing pollution depends on the foregone earnings from increased morbidity and mortality. From this point of view a given amount of health impairing pollution should be done in the country with the lowest cost, which will be the country with the lowest wages. I think the economic logic behind dumping a load of toxic waste in the lowest wage country is impeccable and we should face up to that.

‘Dirty’ Industries: Just between you and me, shouldn’t the World Bank be encouraging MORE migration of the dirty industries to the LDCs [Less Developed Countries]? I can think of three reasons:

1) The measurements of the costs of health impairing pollution depends on the foregone earnings from increased morbidity and mortality. From this point of view a given amount of health impairing pollution should be done in the country with the lowest cost, which will be the country with the lowest wages. I think the economic logic behind dumping a load of toxic waste in the lowest wage country is impeccable and we should face up to that.
Dirty Industries: Just between you and me, shouldn't the World Bank be encouraging MORE migration of the dirty industries to the LDCs [Less Developed Countries]? I can think of three reasons:

2) The costs of pollution are likely to be non-linear as the initial increments of pollution probably have very low cost. I’ve always though that under-populated countries in Africa are vastly UNDER-polluted, their air quality is probably vastly inefficiently low compared to Los Angeles or Mexico City. Only the lamentable facts that so much pollution is generated by non-tradable industries (transport, electrical generation) and that the unit transport costs of solid waste are so high prevent world welfare enhancing trade in air pollution and waste.
3) The demand for a clean environment for aesthetic and health reasons is likely to have very high income elasticity. The concern over an agent that causes a one in a million change in the odds of prostrate (sic) cancer is obviously going to be much higher in a country where people survive to get prostrate cancer than in a country where under 5 mortality is 200 per thousand.
“Your reasoning is perfectly logical but totally insane.”

Your thoughts are a concrete example of the unbelievable alienation, reductionist thinking, social ruthlessness and the arrogant ignorance of many conventional ‘economists’ concerning the nature of the world we live in... If the World Bank keeps you as vice president it will lose all credibility.

Brazilian environment secretary José Lutzenberger (fired soon after); Summers became US Treasury Secretary, a Wall Street tycoon, President of Harvard and Obama's economic czar.
first time SA hosted global environment conference: WSSD

World Summit on Sustainable Development
Johannesburg, 31 August 2002: 30,000 protested UN 'type-two partnerships', privatisation of water, emissions trading, 'neoliberalised nature'
I worry the corporates have too much say...
A Timetable to Reduce Emissions?! ...not until there's more evidence of global climate change!
'Care must be taken to ensure that cities and roads, factories and farms are designed, managed, and regulated as efficiently as possible to wisely use natural resources while supporting the robust growth developing countries still need... [to move the economy] away from suboptimalities and increase efficiency – and hence contribute to short-term growth – while protecting the environment.'

not mentioned by World Bank:

* financial speculation in commodities and nature,
* export-led growth, or
* irrationality of so much international trade, including wasted bunker fuel for shipping.
1) Sustainable Development Goals

1) history of the concept – especially uses and abuses

2) problems with multilateral institutions’ applications

3) miscounting Millennium Development Goal impacts

4) perpetual privatisation of public and merit goods

5) ignoring activist initiatives – especially in public health

full critique: http://www.therules.org
This collection of original essays provides an in-depth look at how South Africa’s government is tackling profound challenges - including economic policy, AIDS, social security, housing, basic services and education - and how society reacts.

Leading analysts show how missed opportunities during Thabo Mbeki’s 1999-2008 administration can be addressed by Jacob Zuma’s. But so far, the transition has witnessed continuity not change.

The book provides not only trenchant critiques of inherited poverty-fighting strategies imposed through neoliberal orthodoxy, including the ‘two economies’ narrative and claims of a ‘developmental state’ in the making. It also suggests new approaches that make more sense.

In the wake of a political leadership substitution – albeit a ‘feint left, pass right’ (as did Zuma, the great midfield general, during Robben Island soccer games) – there is once again a vibrant debate regarding alternatives.

One reason is the intense community and labour protest that arose over the past decade. Social mobilisation is not likely to fade in the immediate future, whether via unprecedented numbers of municipal uprisings, labour strikes or social movement activism.

However, there are distinct problems with each type of bottom-up challenge. Sober reflection about the limits of social agency is required for the period ahead, given the experiences since civil society opposition emerged ten years ago.

Chapter authors include Gillian Hart, Ben Fine, Andries du Toit, Greg Ruiters, Prishani Naidoo, Franco Barchiesi, Fred Hendricks, Lungisile Ntebeza, Enver Motala, Salim Valiy, Carol Anne Spreen, Jackie Cock, Hein Marais, Mark Heywood, Mary Galvin, Lenny Gentle, Trevor Ngwane and James Ferguson.

Based in Durban, Brij Maharaj and Patrick Bond are senior professors at the University of KwaZulu-Natal, in Geography and Development Studies, respectively, and Ashwin Desai was formerly senior researcher at the University of Johannesburg Centre for Sociological Research. The chapters in this volume were sponsored by the South Africa Netherlands Research Programme on Alternatives in Development.
South Africa to launch 'war on poverty'

28 July 2008

South Africa is to launch a nationwide campaign to reduce poverty among the country's poorest citizens, President Thabo Mbeki said on Sunday.

Briefing reporters in Cape Town on Sunday on a three-day Cabinet meeting that took place in Pretoria last week, Mbeki said the campaign would kick off in August, focusing on the most deprived wards in all nine provinces.
The war on poverty begins

November 22 2008 at 10:32am

By Vusi Gumede

One of the arguments Frantz Fanon presented to the world in 1961 remains the most critical question of our times.

He argued that "what matters today is the need for redistribution of wealth". He added that "humanity will have to address this question, no matter how devastating the consequences may be".

These days, a leading scholar of development, Amartya Sen, reminds us of a similar question that preoccupied Fanon during his last battle with leukaemia. Sen begs us to be cognisant of "development as freedom".

During the last couple of months, the "poverty hearings" under the leadership of Archbishop Emeritus Njongonkulu Ndungane hammered home a message that "people in South Africa are poorer than 10 years ago".

Put differently, there is "deterioration in people's welfare". This is contestable. On various occasions, we have tried to clarify the socio-economic status of ordinary South Africans.

The point we argue is that wherever one looks - according to various researchers - whichever poverty line is used, income poverty seems to have declined since about 2002 and data on other dimensions of poverty show indisputable improvements in living conditions, albeit in some cases far better than others; and the gap between rich and poor is still of major concern.
SA 'must intensify war on poverty'

Chris Bathembu

10 October 2011

South Africa will have to intensify its fight against poverty if the country is to meet its Millennium Development Goals, Deputy President Kgalema Motlanthe said after a visit to Ga-Kgatla village in Limpopo province on the weekend.

"There is a consensus that we have to do more groundwork in addressing this problem, because for us to realise our development goals as a country we ought to deal with the abject poverty first," Motlanthe said.
Motlanthe visits War on Poverty projects

Ga-Katla - Government needs to intensify its fight against poverty if South Africa is to meet its Millennium Development Goals, Deputy President Kgalema Motlanthe has conceded.

"There is a consensus that we have to do more ground work in addressing this problem because for us to realise our development goals as a country we ought to deal with the abject poverty first," Motlanthe said.

He was speaking during a visit to Limpopo at the weekend as part of government's War on Poverty campaign launched in 2008. The campaign, headed by Motlanthe's office, led to the establishment of anti-poverty War Rooms in all nine provinces with the aim of alleviating poverty in the most deprived communities by 2014.
StatsSA’s rebasing of poverty line brings about a substantial increase in the estimates for overall poverty (from 45.5% to 53.8%) when a switch is made from the existing upper-bound poverty line of R620 per-person-per-month to the revised level of R779 per-person-per-month.
SA has a far lower public domestic debt than peer economies Malaysia, Brazil, Argentina, Thailand.

Why we can afford more than tokenism: borrow more locally (or even ‘Quantitative Easing’ à la US Fed)

could SA’s Treasury spend more?
Gross national debt over 100 years

SA state borrowing modest in historical terms
very modest post-apartheid increase in social spending

this rise is ‘tokenistic’

Source: National Treasury, 2009; International Monetary Fund, 2010b.
Figure 0.8. Public social expenditure in OECD countries and emerging economies

Total public social expenditure, latest year available 1-2

% of GDP

OECD countries

OECD average

SA social spending is actually very modest, e.g. compared to Brazil

1. Data refer to 2007 for OECD member countries, 2005 for Brazil, 2006-07 for India and South Africa and 2008 for China.
2. Policy areas covered include old-age, survivors, incapacity-related benefits, family, health, active labour market policies, unemployment, housing.
3. Information on data for Israel: http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/888932315602.

High Corporate Profitability and Onerous Regulation

Source: IMF Article IV on SA, July 2013

redistribution needed and possible
2) South Africa’s “War on Poverty”

1) public relations gimmickry

2) Talk Left, Walk Right

3) evidence of poverty increasing

4) yet much higher state spending is possible, desirable

5) at a time inequality is becoming an extreme worry
Bretton Woods Institution Narratives about Inequality and Economic Vulnerability on the Eve of South African Austerity

Patrick Bond
South Africa Economic Update

Fiscal Policy and Redistribution in an Unequal Society

Question 1: How do taxes & spending redistribute income?

**FISCAL POLICY IS PROGRESSIVE**

Taxes collected mainly from the rich help fund social programs that benefit the poor.

Addressing Twin Challenges of Poverty and Inequality Going Forward:

**AMID LIMITED FISCAL SPACE, GROWTH, JOBS & EFFICIENT PUBLIC SERVICES ARE NEEDED TO REINFORCE FISCAL POLICY**

---

Fiscal Consolidation Is Needed To Contain A Rising Debt Burden

**FISCAL POLICY REDUCES THE GINI BY ALMOST A QUARTER**

Perfect equality in income.

ALL INCOME WITH ONE PERSON

Fiscal Policy Reduced Income Inequality By Narrowing Gap Between The Rich & Poor

---

Source: National Treasury Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
Fiscal Policy Reduced Income Inequality By Narrowing Gap Between The Rich & Poor
 corporate welfare spending (crony capitalism) with massive implications for implicit income: e-tolled roads, rail (especially the Gautrain), SAA passengers; tax-loopholed industrial districts; the world’s cheapest electricity during most of the past century; discounted water and wastewater; research and development support; and export subsidies

**Free Basic Services** adverse impact on inequality and consumption (depends on shape and slope of tariff curve)

Treasury’s deregulatory attitude to **profit expatriation** since 1995, when exchange controls were first relaxed

**Natural Capital accounting**
Fiscal Consolidation Is Needed To Contain A Rising Debt Burden

Source: National Treasury Medium-Term Budget Policy Statement
Treasury deputy director-general Michael Sachs (5 Nov): “Current levels of spending are sustainable, provided that real growth remains above 3 [percent per year]. In a secular stagnation scenario, social spending will be increasingly difficult to sustain.”
can there be a non-tokenistic child grant and pension?
3) improvements in South Africa’s Gini coefficient inequality measure

1) ‘improvements’ from World Bank (and Tulane University) have an extreme bias
2) amongst other problems, they leave out ‘corporate welfare’ and differential services
3) in turn, this narrative helped generate early moves of an austerity drive, with Finance Minister Nhlanhla Nene cutting grants by 3% in 2015 – while allowing rich South Africans to take R10 million out of SA (up from R4 mn)
Herman Daly’s mandates for genuine sustainable development in 1996 ‘farewell to World Bank’

- stop counting natural capital as income;
- tax labour and income less, tax resource throughput more;
- maximize the productivity of natural capital in the short run, and invest in increasing its supply in the long run; and
- move away from the ideology of global economic integration by free trade, free capital mobility, and export-led growth – and toward a more nationalist orientation that seeks to develop domestic production for internal markets as the first option, having recourse to international trade only when clearly much more efficient.
"Africa Rising" (# of citations)
“Africa Rising” GDP percentage increases, 1981-2012

Note: 2011 and 2012 excluding Libya.
Source: Leibfritz and Flaig (2013).
MISSING FROM GDP:

- non-renewable resource depletion
- air, water, and noise pollution
- loss of farmland and wetlands
- unpaid women's/community work
- family breakdown
- other social values
- crime

Genuine Progress Indicator

A “genuine progress indicator” corrects the bias in GDP Source: redefiningprogress.org
the turn to ‘natural capital’ accounting by 10 African states, 24 May 2012

THE GABORONE DECLARATION

We, the participants at the Summit for Sustainability in Africa, meeting from 24 to 25 May 2012 in Gaborone, Botswana,

REAFFIRM OUR COMMITMENT TO IMPLEMENT ALL CONVENTIONS AND DECLARATIONS THAT PROMOTE SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT, IN

COMMUNIQUÉ ON NATURAL CAPITAL ACCOUNTING

Recognizing the limitations of GDP as a measure of well-being and sustainable growth that values environmental and social aspects of progress,

TO ENSURE THAT THE CONTRIBUTIONS OF NATURAL CAPITAL TO SUSTAINABLE ECONOMIC GROWTH, MAINTENANCE AND IMPROVEMENT OF SOCIAL CAPITAL AND HUMAN WELL-BEING ARE QUANTIFIED AND INTEGRATED INTO DEVELOPMENT AND BUSINESS PRACTICE;

Through:

- Integrating the value of natural capital into national accounting and corporate planning and reporting processes, policies, and programmes, in agreed efforts, including the appended Communiqué on Natural Capital Accounting,
- Building social capital and reducing poverty by transitioning agriculture, extractive industries, fisheries and other natural capital uses to practices that promote sustainable employment, food security, sustainable energy and the protection of natural capital through protected areas and other mechanisms,
- Ecosystem restoration measures, as well as actions that mitigate stresses on natural capital,
By the numbers

10 Signatory Countries

Visionary leaders from **10 African countries** have committed to moving the value of nature to the center of their development strategies. The signatory countries are Botswana, Gabon, Ghana, Kenya, Liberia, Mozambique, Namibia, Rwanda, South Africa and Tanzania. Membership is still open to other interested countries.
World Bank (minimalist) adjustments to 'genuine savings' fixed capital (-), education (+), natural resource depletion (-), and pollution (-).

Most influential natural capital accounting
World Bank (minimalist) adjustments to ‘genuine savings’
fixed capital (-), education (+), natural resource depletion (-), and pollution (-)

World Bank adjustments to ‘genuine savings’

Change in wealth per capita offers a comprehensive framework to look at sustainability threats to the twin goals. It is derived from standard national accounting measures of gross national savings by making four types of adjustments (Figure 1):

1. Deduction for depreciation of produced capital, measured by capital consumption of produced assets;
2. Addition from human capital formation, measured by current expenditures on education;
3. Deduction for depletion of natural capital, including minerals, energy, and forest resources; and
4. Deduction for wealth-diluting effects of population growth, based on the additional savings needed to keep current tangible wealth per capita constant with a changing population.

As the case of Sub-Saharan Africa in 2010 illustrates, aggregated gross savings and formation of human capital are not sufficient to compensate for depreciation of produced capital, depletion of natural capital, and population growth. The result: the region is wealth depleting (Figure 1).

Furthermore, Sub-Saharan Africa is the region with the poorest record on sustainability. 88 percent of its countries were found to be depleting their wealth in 2010 (Table 1). The share of countries with wealth depletion—globally at about 45 percent—decreases as income levels increase (Table 1), indicating that poorer countries face severe sustainability challenges.

In many resource-rich countries, reinvesting natural resource rents in other forms of productive capital is one important way of avoiding wealth depletion.

### Table 1. Overview: Data and Wealth Depletion in 2010

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>Number of countries with data</th>
<th>Share of countries with wealth depletion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Global</td>
<td>136</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High income countries</td>
<td>41</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Upper middle income</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>34%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower middle income</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low income</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Asia</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>17%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Europe &amp; Central Asia</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Asia &amp; Pacific</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>36%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle East &amp; North Africa</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>43%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America &amp; Caribbean</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>88%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

South Africa's natural capital accounts
a first cut in the World Bank's Changing Wealth of Nations (2011)

substantial 'subsoil assets' within 'natural capital' ($/capita)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economy/Group</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Subsoil Assets</th>
<th>Timber</th>
<th>Nontimber Forest Resources</th>
<th>Protected Areas</th>
<th>Crop Land</th>
<th>Pasture Land</th>
<th>Natural Capital</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>46,888,200</td>
<td>2,595</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>1,915</td>
<td>985</td>
<td>5,723</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

depletion of subsoil (mineral) assets = 9% of income

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economy/Group</th>
<th>Gross National Savings</th>
<th>Consumption of Fixed Capital</th>
<th>Net National Savings</th>
<th>Education Expenditure</th>
<th>Energy Depletion</th>
<th>Mineral Depletion</th>
<th>Net Forest Depletion</th>
<th>CO₂ Damage</th>
<th>PM Damage</th>
<th>Adjusted Net Savings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>16.1</td>
<td>13.9</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>5.1</td>
<td>6.4</td>
<td>2.6</td>
<td>0.5</td>
<td>1.3</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>-3.4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

net decline in SA's per person wealth: $245

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economy</th>
<th>GNI Per Capita (US$)</th>
<th>Population Growth Rate (%)</th>
<th>Adjusted Net Saving Per Capita (US$)</th>
<th>Change in Wealth Per Capita (US$)</th>
<th>Adjusted Net Saving Gap (% GNI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>South Africa</td>
<td>5,073</td>
<td>1.1</td>
<td>-63</td>
<td>-245</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Africa Rising”  
(really?)

Source: Authors’ calculations based on World Bank data.
“Africa Middle Class Rising” (hmmm, a $2/day 'middle class'?)

Buying In
Africa’s middle class has risen to 34% of the population, expanding to 313 million people.

SHARE OF AFRICA’S POPULATION, BY CLASS

Data not available for all countries. Source: African Development Bank Group.

what's rising? multinational corporate profits as a percentage of firm equity

and African *protests* Rising

[Graph showing public protest and civil violence in Africa from 1996 to 2013.](www.africaneconomicoutlook.org/en/outlook/governance) 

*Agence France Press*
African *protests* rising

The top ten motivations of protests in 2013 (as % of total protests reported):

- Demand for salary increase
- Protesting the legitimacy of the governance and management rules
- Demand for dissolution of government or stepping down of the head of state
- Unemployment/pressure for new recruitment plan
- Quality of public service delivery
- Working conditions
- Unpaid salaries
- Demand for more political rights and civil liberties, more equality
- Reaction to executive overreach (arrests of journalists, protesters, opposition, etc.)
- Protesting political or legal reforms or proposals thereof

Source: Authors’ calculations based on AFP information.

http://dx.doi.org/10.1787/888932807474
in 2014, a slight decline in African protests (but maybe due to bored AFP/Reuters journos)

Remarkably, this rise in public protests contrasts with the “flatter” trend of violence by non-state actors. Also worth noticing is the fact that, while some governments have resorted to violence against demonstrators, most have shown a growing tolerance for freedom of expression. After peaking in 2013, at levels more than five times higher than ten years before, protests started to decrease slightly in 2014. This trend reflects an easing of tensions in most African countries, which contrasts with heightened tensions in a limited number of hot spots. The political normalisation of countries that had been in crisis, particularly since the Arab Spring, partly explains the overall decline in the intensity of protests.
African political protests

Map of West Africa showing Burkina Faso

Signs in French and English (translated: The Temple demands the departure or resignation of Captain Compaoré)

Protesters holding signs and marching in streets
African protests (and food prices) rising
http://ejolt.org maps eco-social conflict metabolism

10 YEARS Pambazuka News
PAN-AFRICAN VOICES FOR FREEDOM AND JUSTICE
### Competitiveness Rankings

In your country, how do you characterize labor-employer relations? [1 = generally confrontational; 7 = generally cooperative]

#### WORLD’S TEN MOST PLACID NATIONAL WORKING CLASSES plus AFRICAN WORKING CLASSES MORE MILITANT THAN THE MEAN

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Economy</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Qatar</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**South Africa** is ranked 140th with a score of 2.5.

---

**The Global Competitiveness Report 2015–2016**

Insight Report

Klaus Schwab, World Economic Forum
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Economy</th>
<th>Score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Switzerland</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Denmark</td>
<td>6.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Singapore</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Norway</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Japan</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Austria</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Sweden</td>
<td>5.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Netherlands</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Qatar</td>
<td>5.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Luxembourg</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Hong Kong SAR</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>New Zealand</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>United Arab Emirates</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Ireland</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Iceland</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Brunei</td>
<td>5.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Costa Rica</td>
<td>5.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Taiwan, China</td>
<td>5.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Germany</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>United Kingdom</td>
<td>5.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Finland</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Rwanda</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Guatemala</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Canada</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Philippines</td>
<td>5.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>26</td>
<td>Albania</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Estonia</td>
<td>5.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Honduras</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Latvia</td>
<td>4.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>United States</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Mauritius</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Bhutan</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Thailand</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>South Korea</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>36</td>
<td>Sri Lanka</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**140 South Africa**
Karl Polanyi’s double movement: waves of globalisation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1795</td>
<td>WWI</td>
<td>Oil Crisis - 1974</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1873-76</td>
<td>WWII</td>
<td>1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1848</td>
<td></td>
<td>2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1933 – Abolition of Gold Standard</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Marketization

Counter-Movement

social and labour movements

climate justice

1834 – Poor Law Reform

Ecological Catastrophe

Source: Michael Burawoy
‘double movement’ against capital, applied to AIDS medicines
BIG PHARMACEUTICALS

AIDS DRUGS
DEVELOPMENT
SECTION

MASS
MURDER
SECTION
ENFORCING
PATENT RIGHTS
TO PREVENT
THE USE OF
GENERICS

M&G 15-2-2018 ZAPIRO
Beware the March of AIDS!
case study of successful SA-internationalist social movement advocacy for AIDS policy and solidarity: access to Anti-RetroVirals

- 1990s – US promotes Intellectual Property above all, so monopoly-patented ARVs cost $10-15,000/person/year – way too expensive!
- 1997 – SA's Medicines Act allows 'compulsory licensing' to break patent for generic producers – i.e., deglobalisation of medicines;
- 1999 – Al Gore for president, ACTUP! opposition to Gore, Seattle WTO protest, Bill Clinton surrender, 'AIDS dissidents' emerge
- 2000 – AIDS conference in Durban, rise of Thabo Mbeki's denialism
- 2001 – 'PMA-SA v Mandela' lawsuit w Medicines sans Frontiers & Oxfam, while TAC imports Thai, Brazilian, Indian generics
TAC’s Anti-RetroVirals campaign:

- 2001 – Constitutional Court supports nevirapine, major World Trade Organisation (TRIPS) concession at Doha
- 2002 – critiques of Mbeki, Tshabalala-Msimang, Erwin
- 2003 – ANC compels change in state policy
- 2004 – generics produced in SA, global AIDS funds increase
- 2013 – 3 million public sector recipients of ARVs

**strategic successes:**

- dramatic rise in life expectancy from 52 in 2005 to 62 in 2015
- ‘commoning’ of intellectual property
- decommodification, destratification
  - deglobalisation of capital
  - globalisation of solidarity
Copenhagen Accord, COP 15, December 2009

- Jacob Zuma (SA)
- Lula da Silva (Brazil)
- Barack Obama (USA)
- Wen Jiabao (China)
- Manmohan Singh (India)

"they blew up the UN"
(Bill McKibben, 350.org)

USA+‘BASIC’: non-binding deal means 4 degrees increase = 7 degrees in Africa
Africa burning
Durban COP17: ‘Africa’s Climate Summit’

confirmed 21\textsuperscript{st}-c. climate-related deaths of 180 million Africans

(Christian Aid)
COP 17
Gambling on the future of the Planet

NO RIFFRAFF!...THE STAKES ARE TOO HIGH!

BIG POLLUTER NATIONS
BIG DEVELOPING POLLUTERS
BIG OIL
BIG NUKES
BIG GAS
BIG COAL

YESSIR!

CLIMATE JUSTICE!

THE TIMES 29-12-14
ZAPIRO
are UN negotiations to reduce greenhouse gas emissions working?
World Bank chief backs fossil fuel divestment drive

Jim Yong Kim says levels of carbon dioxide threaten development gains over the past two decades

Can Jim Yong Kim end World Bank backing for coal-fired power?
The World Bank president has won his board's approval for a new energy strategy. It's a crucial moment for climate change
This Changes Everything: Capitalism vs. the Climate

Naomi Klein, author of the #1 international bestsellers, The Shock Doctrine and No Logo, returns with This Changes Everything, a must-read on how the climate crisis needs to spur transformational political change.

We seem to have given up on any serious effort to prevent catastrophic climate change. Despite mounting scientific evidence, denialism is surging in many wealthy countries, and extreme fossil-fuel extraction gathers pace. Exposing the work of ideologues on the right who know the challenge this poses to the free market all too well, Naomi Klein also challenges the failing strategies of environmental groups.

This Changes Everything argues that the deep changes required should not be viewed as punishments to fear, but as a kind of gift. It's time to stop running from the full implications of the crisis and begin to embrace them.

Naomi Klein is an award-winning journalist, syndicated columnist and author of the international bestsellers, The Shock Doctrine and No Logo. She is a member of the board of directors for 350.org, a global grassroots movement to solve the climate crisis, a Puffin Foundation Writing Fellow at The Nation Institute, and a former Miliband Fellow at the LSE.
This Changes Everything

- **energy** (oil/coal to renewables)
- **transport** (private to public, shipping to local production)
- **urban form** (from sprawling suburbs to compact cities)
- **housing/services** (from hedonism to socio-ecological)
- **agriculture/food** (from semi-feudal, sugar-saturated, carbon-intensive plantation-grown to organic, cooperative and vegetarian-centric)
- **production** (from multinational-corporate capitalist logic to 'Just Transition' localization, eco-social planning and cooperation)
- **consumption** (from advertisement-driven, high-carbon, import-intensive and materialistic to de-commodified basic-needs guarantees and eco-socially sound consumption norms)
- **disposal** (from planned obsolescence to 'zero-waste')
- **health, education, arts and social policy** (from capitalist-determined to post-carbon, post-capitalist)
- **social/private space** (from durable race/class/gender segregation to public space, recreation, desegregation and human liberation)
This is a moment for human solidarity.

Above all, the global climate moment is also Africa's moment – Africa's moment to lead the world.